Dear Ministers,

Re: Bill 156, Security from Trespass and Protecting Food Safety Act, 2019

We the undersigned Canadian law professors and constitutional and criminal law experts write to express our concerns with Bill 156, Security from Trespass and Protecting Food Safety Act, 2019 (“Bill 156”). Aspects of the Bill would infringe individuals’ rights to freedom of expression and peaceful assembly, and therefore violate the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms (“Charter”).

Bill 156 increases fines for trespassing on agricultural property. In an effort to muzzle employee whistleblowers, it also makes it an offence to gain access to a farm under “false pretenses”. Owners of farm property are given significant powers to arrest individuals on their property. The Bill also restricts individuals’ ability to peacefully gather on public property near trucks transporting animals to slaughter.

In the United States, courts have struck down laws similar to section 4(6) of Bill 156 on the basis that laws restricting or prohibiting whistleblowing activities on farms violate the First Amendment right to free speech. These laws are commonly known as “agricultural gag (ag-gag) laws”. For instance, the US District Court in Utah found misrepresentations made to gain access to an agricultural facility can be protected under the First Amendment and a law prohibiting access to such facilities under “false pretenses” was overly broad and therefore unconstitutional. In December 2019, the US District Court in Iowa granted a preliminary injunction enjoining the state from enforcing its most recent ag-gag law in light of the public interest in allowing people and organizations to exercise First Amendment rights and educate the public about important animal welfare and food safety issues.

Until November 2019, there were no ag-gag laws in Canada. Alarmingly, Alberta recently passed such a law after hurrying it through the legislative process in just 10 days. Now, Ontario is proposing to follow suit with Bill 156.

Fundamentally, section 2(b) of the Charter is aimed at promoting and safeguarding the open debate and discussion essential to a free and democratic society. The right to freedom of expression is fundamental to a democracy and is protected under section 2(b) of the Charter.

2 Animal Legal Defense Fund et al. v Kimberly Reynolds et al. (Case 4:19-cv-00124-JEG-HCA).
expression includes expression that gives the public, including consumers, access to information that would enable them to make informed food purchasing choices.4

Whistleblowers have long played a vital role in exposing animal cruelty, unsafe working conditions, and environmental problems on industrial farming operations. Such exposés are in the public interest, promoting an open dialogue about animal use practices and food safety. Ag-gag laws can also adversely affect industry by eroding public confidence in the food system.5

It is in the public interest for employees to expose unlawful and unethical activity, even when doing so requires not revealing their full intentions to their employer. Therefore, dishonest, and even offensive, speech in these circumstances is protected by the American First Amendment. It is similarly protected under section 2(b) of the Charter.

As with many US ag-gag laws, section 4(6) of Bill 156 appears to target investigative journalists and protected speech, and has no connection to the stated goal of protecting property and biosecurity. It would insulate private actors from being held publicly accountable. Section 5(2) would unreasonably curtail rights to protest on public property. In an open democratic society, streets and other public places are an important place for public discussion and political expression.6 Protecting rights to protest on public property is critically important to safeguard freedom of expression, and its corollary, the right to listen.

Whistleblowers play a major role in shaping public opinion and policies around agricultural practices. If Bill 156 is passed as-drafted, it would effectively cut off an important source of public information and a driver of policy change. It would silence journalists and those who advocate for animal protection by exposing the abuse of animals at agricultural facilities and violate their Charter rights to freedom of expression. We urge the Government of Ontario to amend Bill 156 and respect the basic constitutional rights of its citizens.

Yours truly,

Richard Moon
Professor
University of Windsor Faculty of Law

Cheryl Milne
Executive Director
David Asper Centre for Constitutional Rights
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Peter Sankoff
Professor & Associate Dean, Faculty Development
University of Alberta Faculty of Law

Don Stuart
Emeritus Professor
Queen’s University Faculty of Law

A. Wayne MacKay, CM, QC
Professor Emeritus of Law
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Jodi Lazare
Assistant Professor
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title/Position</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Angela Fernandez</td>
<td>Associate Professor, Canada Research Chair in Democracy, Constitutionalism, and Electoral Law</td>
<td>University of Toronto, Faculty of Law &amp; Department of History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yasmin Dawood</td>
<td>Associate Professor of Law &amp; Political Science, University of Toronto</td>
<td>Faculty of Law &amp; Department of History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emmett Macfarlane</td>
<td>Associate Professor &amp; Associate Chair Graduate Studies</td>
<td>University of Toronto, Faculty of Law &amp; Department of History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jessica Eisen</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>University of Alberta Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Devlin, FRSC</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constance MacIntosh</td>
<td>Viscount Bennett Professor of Law</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Berger Richardson</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>University of Ottawa Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adelina Iftene</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucie Guibault</td>
<td>Associate Professor &amp; Associate Dean Graduate Studies</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jonathan Shapiro</td>
<td>Senior Instructor</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lynda Collins</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daphne Gilbert</td>
<td>Associate Professor &amp; Vice Dean Governance</td>
<td>University of Ottawa Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Coughlan</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicole O’Byrne</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James H. Silver</td>
<td>Silver Pennypacker Barristers, Certified Criminal Law Specialist</td>
<td>Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janet Austin</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerri Froc</td>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>Silver Pennypacker Barristers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexandra Pester</td>
<td>Associate</td>
<td>Silver Pennypacker Barristers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary J. Grill</td>
<td>Grill Barristers</td>
<td>Lansdowne Chair in Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maneesha Deckha</td>
<td>Certified Criminal Law Specialist</td>
<td>University of Victoria Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Macklem</td>
<td>Professor &amp; William C. Graham Professor of Law</td>
<td>Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James H. Silver</td>
<td>York University Osgoode Hall Law School, Certified Criminal Law Specialist</td>
<td>University of Victoria Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katie Sykes</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>University of Victoria Faculty of Law</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Stepan Wood
Professor
Canada Research Chair in Law, Society, and Sustainability
Director, Centre for Law and the Environment
University of British Columbia
Peter A. Allard School of Law

Bruce B. Ryder
Associate Professor
Academic Director, Anti-Discrimination Intensive Program
Vice-President Membership, Canadian Law and Society Association
York University Osgoode Hall Law School

Sophie Thériault
Professor & Vice-Dean, Academics
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section

Laura Bowman
Barrister & Solicitor
Ecojustice

Heather McLeod-Kilmurray
Associate Professor
Centre for Environmental Law & Global Sustainability
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
Common Law Section

Amir Attaran
Professor
Canada Research Chair in Law, Population Health and Global Development Policy
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
Common Law Section

Naomi Metallic
Chancellor’s Chair in Aboriginal Law and Policy
Assistant Professor
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Leo Salloum
Associate
Grill Barristers

Audrey Macklin
Director, Centre for Criminology and Sociolegal Studies
Professor & Chair in Human Rights Law
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Lesli Bisgould
Barrister & Solicitor
Adjunct Professor
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Ariel Katz
Associate Professor
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Martha Shaffer
Professor
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Lisa Austin
Professor, Chair in Law and Technology
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Amar Khoday
Associate Professor
University of Manitoba Faculty of Law

James L. Turk
Director, Centre for Free Expression
Ryerson University
Faculty of Communications and Design