

February 6, 2019

Honourable Doug Downey  
Ministry of the Attorney General  
720 Bay Street, 11th Floor  
Toronto, ON M7A 2S9

Honourable Ernie Hardeman  
Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs  
77 Grenville St., 11th Floor  
Toronto, ON M5S 1B3

Dear Ministers,

**Re: Bill 156, *Security from Trespass and Protecting Food Safety Act, 2019***

We the undersigned Canadian law professors and constitutional and criminal law experts write to express our concerns with Bill 156, *Security from Trespass and Protecting Food Safety Act, 2019* (“**Bill 156**”). Aspects of the Bill would infringe individuals’ rights to freedom of expression and peaceful assembly, and therefore violate the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* (“*Charter*”).

Bill 156 increases fines for trespassing on agricultural property. In an effort to muzzle employee whistleblowers, it also makes it an offence to gain access to a farm under “false pretenses”. Owners of farm property are given significant powers to arrest individuals on their property. The Bill also restricts individuals’ ability to peacefully gather on public property near trucks transporting animals to slaughter.

In the United States, courts have struck down laws similar to section 4(6) of Bill 156 on the basis that laws restricting or prohibiting whistleblowing activities on farms violate the First Amendment right to free speech. These laws are commonly known as “agricultural gag (ag-gag) laws”. For instance, the US District Court in Utah found misrepresentations made to gain access to an agricultural facility can be protected under the First Amendment and a law prohibiting access to such facilities under “false pretenses” was overly broad and therefore unconstitutional.<sup>1</sup> In December 2019, the US District Court in Iowa granted a preliminary injunction enjoining the state from enforcing its most recent ag-gag law in light of the public interest in allowing people and organizations to exercise First Amendment rights and educate the public about important animal welfare and food safety issues.<sup>2</sup>

Until November 2019, there were no ag-gag laws in Canada. Alarmingly, Alberta recently passed such a law after hurrying it through the legislative process in just 10 days. Now, Ontario is proposing to follow suit with Bill 156.

Fundamentally, section 2(b) of the *Charter* is aimed at promoting and safeguarding the open debate and discussion essential to a free and democratic society.<sup>3</sup> The right to freedom of

---

<sup>1</sup> *Animal Legal Defense Fund et al. v Herbert et al.* 263 F. Supp. 3d 1193, 1196-98 (D. Utah 2017) (Case No. 2:13-cv-00679-RJS).

<sup>2</sup> *Animal Legal Defense Fund et al. v Kimberly Reynolds et al.* (Case 4:19-cv-00124-JEG-HCA).

<sup>3</sup> *Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Québec (Attorney General)*, [1989] 1 SCR 927 at 976.

expression includes expression that gives the public, including consumers, access to information that would enable them to make informed food purchasing choices.<sup>4</sup>

Whistleblowers have long played a vital role in exposing animal cruelty, unsafe working conditions, and environmental problems on industrial farming operations. Such exposés are in the public interest, promoting an open dialogue about animal use practices and food safety. Ag-gag laws can also adversely affect industry by eroding public confidence in the food system.<sup>5</sup>

It is in the public interest for employees to expose unlawful and unethical activity, even when doing so requires not revealing their full intentions to their employer. Therefore, dishonest, and even offensive, speech in these circumstances is protected by the American First Amendment. It is similarly protected under section 2(b) of the *Charter*.

As with many US ag-gag laws, section 4(6) of Bill 156 appears to target investigative journalists and protected speech, and has no connection to the stated goal of protecting property and biosecurity. It would insulate private actors from being held publicly accountable. Section 5(2) would unreasonably curtail rights to protest on public property. In an open democratic society, streets and other public places are an important place for public discussion and political expression.<sup>6</sup> Protecting rights to protest on public property is critically important to safeguard freedom of expression, and its corollary, the right to listen.

Whistleblowers play a major role in shaping public opinion and policies around agricultural practices. If Bill 156 is passed as-drafted, it would effectively cut off an important source of public information and a driver of policy change. It would silence journalists and those who advocate for animal protection by exposing the abuse of animals at agricultural facilities and violate their *Charter* rights to freedom of expression. We urge the Government of Ontario to amend Bill 156 and respect the basic constitutional rights of its citizens.

Yours truly,  
Richard Moon  
Professor  
University of Windsor Faculty of Law

Cheryl Milne  
Executive Director  
David Asper Centre for Constitutional Rights  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Peter Sankoff  
Professor & Associate Dean, Faculty Development  
University of Alberta Faculty of Law

Don Stuart  
Emeritus Professor  
Queen's University Faculty of Law

A. Wayne MacKay, CM, QC  
Professor Emeritus of Law  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Jodi Lazare  
Assistant Professor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

---

<sup>4</sup> *RJR-MacDonald Inc. v Canada (Attorney General)*, [1995] 3 SCR 199.

<sup>5</sup> See, e.g., “Awareness of ag-gag laws erodes trust in farmers and increases support for animal welfare regulations”, J.A. Robbins, B. Franks, D.M. Weary, M.A.G. von Keyserlingk, *Food Policy* 61 (2016) 121-125.

<sup>6</sup> *Greater Vancouver Transportation Authority v. Canadian Federation of Students — British Columbia Component*, [2009] 2 SCR 295 at paras 42-47, 77; *Montréal (City) v. 2952-1366 Québec Inc.*, [2005] 3 SCR 141 at paras 61, 67; *Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada v. Canada*, [1991] 1 SCR 139 at 150.

Angela Fernandez  
Associate Professor  
University of Toronto  
Faculty of Law & Department of History

Yasmin Dawood  
Canada Research Chair in Democracy,  
Constitutionalism, and Electoral Law  
Associate Professor of Law & Political Science  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Emmett Macfarlane  
Associate Professor & Associate Chair Graduate Studies  
University of Waterloo Department of Political Science

Jessica Eisen  
Assistant Professor  
University of Alberta Faculty of Law

Richard Devlin, FRSC  
Professor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Constance MacIntosh  
Viscount Bennett Professor of Law  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Sarah Berger Richardson  
Assistant Professor  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section

Adelina Iftene  
Assistant Professor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Lucie Guibault  
Associate Professor & Associate Dean Graduate Studies  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Jonathan Shapiro  
Senior Instructor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Lynda Collins  
Professor  
Centre for Environmental Law & Global Sustainability  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law  
Common Law Section

Daphne Gilbert  
Associate Professor & Vice Dean Governance  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law  
Common Law Section

Steve Coughlan  
Professor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Nicole O'Byrne  
Associate Professor  
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

James H. Silver  
Silver Pennypacker Barristers  
Certified Criminal Law Specialist

Janet Austin  
Associate Professor  
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

Kerri Froc  
Assistant Professor  
University of New Brunswick Faculty of Law

Alexandra Pester  
Associate  
Silver Pennypacker Barristers

Gary J. Grill  
Grill Barristers  
Adjunct Professor  
York University Osgoode Hall Law School  
Certified Criminal Law Specialist

Maneesha Deckha  
Professor  
Lansdowne Chair in Law  
Director of Graduate Studies  
University of Victoria Faculty of Law

Patrick Macklem  
Professor & William C. Graham Professor of Law  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Katie Sykes  
Associate Professor  
Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law

Stepan Wood  
Professor  
Canada Research Chair in Law, Society, and  
Sustainability  
Director, Centre for Law and the Environment  
University of British Columbia  
Peter A. Allard School of Law

Bruce B. Ryder  
Associate Professor  
Academic Director, Anti-Discrimination  
Intensive Program  
Vice-President Membership, Canadian Law and  
Society Association  
York University Osgoode Hall Law School

Sophie Thériault  
Professor & Vice-Dean, Academics  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law, Civil Law Section  
Ecojustice

Laura Bowman  
Barrister & Solicitor

Heather McLeod-Kilmurray  
Associate Professor  
Centre for Environmental Law & Global Sustainability  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law  
Common Law Section

Amir Attaran  
Professor  
Canada Research Chair in Law, Population  
Health and Global Development Policy  
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law  
Common Law Section

Naiomi W. Metallic  
Chancellor's Chair in Aboriginal Law and Policy  
Assistant Professor  
Dalhousie University Schulich School of Law

Leo Salloum  
Associate  
Grill Barristers

Audrey Macklin  
Director, Centre for Criminology and Sociolegal Studies  
Professor & Chair in Human Rights Law  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Lesli Bisgould  
Barrister & Solicitor  
Adjunct Professor  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Ariel Katz  
Associate Professor  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Martha Shaffer  
Professor  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Lisa Austin  
Professor, Chair in Law and Technology  
University of Toronto Faculty of Law

Amar Khoday  
Associate Professor  
University of Manitoba Faculty of Law

James L. Turk  
Director, Centre for Free Expression  
Ryerson University  
Faculty of Communications and Design